



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
-----------------	-------------	----------------------	---------------------	------------------

10/586,734

03/26/2007

Juan C. Scaiano

57128-A

5991

2048 7590 04/10/2009

KIRBY EADES GALE BAKER
BOX 3432, STATION D
OTTAWA, ON K1P 6N9
CANADA

EXAMINER

CHIANG, TIMOTHY S

ART UNIT

PAPER NUMBER

1796

MAIL DATE

DELIVERY MODE

04/10/2009

PAPER

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

DETAILED ACTION

Election/Restrictions

1. This application contains claims directed to more than one species of the generic invention. These species are deemed to lack unity of invention because they are not so linked as to form a single general inventive concept under PCT Rule 13.1.

The species are as follows:

- A. Compound **X** of instant claim 10
- B. Compound **I** of instant claim 10 with corresponding compound **V** of instant claim 21
- C. Compound **II** of instant claim 10 with corresponding compound **VI** of instant claim 21
- D. Compound **III** of instant claim 10 with corresponding compound **VII** of instant claim 21
- E. Compound **IV** of instant claim 10 with corresponding compound **VIII** of instant claim 21
- F. Compound **I A** of instant claim 10 with corresponding compound **V A** of instant claim 21
- G. Compound **I B** of instant claim 10 with corresponding compound **V B** of instant claim 21
- H. Compound **II A** of instant claim 10 with corresponding compound **VI A** of instant claim 21

I. Compound **III A** of instant claim 10 with corresponding compound **VII A** of instant claim 21

J. Compound **IV A** of instant claim 10 with corresponding compound **VII A** of instant claim 21

K - M. Where at least one of A• and B• selected from the three compounds represented respectively at the bottom of page 15 of 20 of claims (claim 21)

N. Where at least one of A• and B• selected from compound **IX** of instant claim 21

Applicant is required, in reply to this action, to elect a single species to which the claims shall be restricted if no generic claim is finally held to be allowable. The reply must also identify the claims readable on the elected species, including any claims subsequently added. An argument that a claim is allowable or that all claims are generic is considered non-responsive unless accompanied by an election.

Upon the allowance of a generic claim, applicant will be entitled to consideration of claims to additional species which are written in dependent form or otherwise include all the limitations of an allowed generic claim as provided by 37 CFR 1.141. If claims are added after the election, applicant must indicate which are readable upon the elected species. MPEP § 809.02(a).

The following claim(s) are generic: 1-3, 7, 33-34, 38-40, 42-43, 45, 47-48, 51, 53-54, 56.

2. The species listed above do not relate to a single general inventive concept under PCT Rule 13.1 because, under PCT Rule 13.2, the species lack the same or corresponding special technical features for the following reasons: PCT Rule 13.2 states:

Art Unit: 1796

13.2 Circumstances in Which the Requirement of Unity of Invention Is to Be Considered Fulfilled

Where a group of inventions is claimed in one and the same international application, the requirement of unity of invention referred to in Rule 13.1 shall be fulfilled only when there is a technical relationship among those inventions involving one or more of the same or corresponding special technical features. The expression "special technical features" shall mean those technical features that define a contribution which each of the claimed inventions, considered as a whole, makes over the prior art.

Seltzer et al. (WO 2004/055141 "hereinafter "Seltzer") discloses an antioxidant composition comprising polycyclic aromatic ring system, specifically the structure IA of group F alone in the disclosure.

3. The examiner has required restriction between product and process claims.

Where applicant elects claims directed to the product, and the product claims are subsequently found allowable, withdrawn process claims that depend from or otherwise require all the limitations of the allowable product claim will be considered for rejoinder. All claims directed to a nonelected process invention must require all the limitations of an allowable product claim for that process invention to be rejoined.

In the event of rejoinder, the requirement for restriction between the product claims and the rejoined process claims will be withdrawn, and the rejoined process claims will be fully examined for patentability in accordance with 37 CFR 1.104. Thus, to be allowable, the rejoined claims must meet all criteria for patentability including the requirements of 35 U.S.C. 101, 102, 103 and 112. Until all claims to the elected product are found allowable, an otherwise proper restriction requirement between product claims and process claims may be maintained. Withdrawn process claims that are not commensurate in scope with an allowable product claim will not be rejoined. See MPEP § 821.04(b). Additionally, in order to retain the right to rejoinder in accordance with the

Art Unit: 1796

above policy, applicant is advised that the process claims should be amended during prosecution to require the limitations of the product claims. **Failure to do so may result in a loss of the right to rejoinder.** Further, note that the prohibition against double patenting rejections of 35 U.S.C. 121 does not apply where the restriction requirement is withdrawn by the examiner before the patent issues. See MPEP § 804.01.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to TIMOTHY CHIANG whose telephone number is (571)270-7348. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday - Thursday 9:00AM-5:00PM EST.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Harold Pyon can be reached on 571-272-1498. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

/Harold Y Pyon/

Application/Control Number: 10/586,734

Page 6

Art Unit: 1796

Supervisory Patent Examiner, Art
Unit 1796

/TIMOTHY CHIANG/
Examiner, Art Unit 1796
02/19/2009